

**MEETING No. 32  
Newcastle Community Consultative Committee on the Environment  
(NCCCE)**

**MEETING MINUTES**

**Date:** 12 November 2014 **Time:** 5:30 pm

**File:** EF13/8723

**Location:** EPA Conference Room, Ground Floor,  
117 Bull Street, Newcastle West

**In attendance:** John Tate (Chair), Rick Banyard (Community), Keith Craig (Community), Nick Godfrey-Smith (Industry), Terry McCauley (Community), Zoe Rogers (Environment), Paul Thomas (Industry), Sherree Woodroffe (Industry), Gary Davey (EPA Director North), Sylvia Bell (EPA Director Stakeholder Engagement and Governance), Adam Gilligan (EPA Manager Hunter Region), Leanne Graham (EPA Project Officer).

**Apologies** Paul McBain (Minister's Nominee), (Newcastle City Council representative).

**Meeting Record**

Agenda Item	Meeting Details
Item 1	<p><b>Welcome</b> Chair welcomed attendees. The Chair advised that Ms Rogers had tendered her resignation from the NCCCE. The Chair thanked Ms Rogers for her active participation and valuable contribution to debate representing environmental interests on the Committee, since its inception. The Chair commended Ms Rogers for consistently demonstrating the courage of her convictions as and encouraged her to maintain an interest in representing her community. On behalf of NCCCE, the Chair wished Ms Rogers well for the future.</p>
Item 2	<p><b>Apologies</b> As above.</p>
Item 3	<p><b>Minutes from Previous Meeting (10 September 2014)</b> The previous minutes were adopted, pending approval by absent committee members.</p>
Item 4	<p><b>Actions Arising from Previous Meetings</b> <u>Meeting No.31 (8Oct14) Action 1:</u> Completed 10/10/14. EPA emailed NCCCE, reminding members to provide individual feedback to researchers on the draft final report of the Lower Hunter Community Research Project Report, before 26 October 2014. <u>Meeting No.31 (8Oct14) Action 2:</u> Completed 12/11/14. EPA invited NCCCE to share feedback on the Lower Hunter Community Research Project Report (Item 5 below). <u>Meeting No.31 (8Oct14) Action 3:</u> Completed 30/10/14. EPA emailed NCCCE an online link to the EPA Strategic Plan 2014-17.</p>

Agenda Item	Meeting Details
	<p><u>Meeting No.31 (8Oct14) Action 4:</u> Completed 12/11/14. EPA provided a briefing for NCCCE on the EPA Strategic Plan 2014-17 (Item 6 below).</p> <p><u>Meeting No.31 (8Oct14) Action 5:</u> Update 12/11/14. EPA organised an independently facilitated planning session for NCCCE to identify priorities, tentatively for 28/01/15.</p>
<p><b>Item 5</b></p>	<p><b>Feedback on the Lower Hunter Community Research Project Report</b></p> <p>Ms Bell tabled the comments from the review of the draft report by the research cohort, which included NCCCE. Macquarie University researchers recommended actions in response to the comments and indicated how the comment would be incorporated into the final report.</p> <p>Ms Bell advised that Macquarie University researchers are currently finalising the report in response to the feedback. EPA expects to publish the report and EPA's response by 31/12/14.</p> <p>The Chair noted the feedback and thanked Ms Bell.</p>
<p><b>Item 6</b></p>	<p><b>EPA Strategic Plan 2014-17</b></p> <p>Mr Davey provided an overview of the EPA's Strategic Plan 2014-17, which documents the EPA's role and its relationships with government, business and the community, in order to protect the environment and to focus on stakeholder needs.</p> <p>Key points included:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The Strategic Plan is driven by the NSW Government's plan <i>NSW 2021</i> which sets out how the government will deliver on numerous community priorities</li> <li>• The plan is reviewed and updated annually.</li> <li>• The plan sets out six key result areas (<i>KRAs</i>), which aim to achieve specific goals in <i>NSW 2021</i></li> <li>• <i>KRA 1: Informed planning decisions</i> relates to the EPA's role within the Government's Planning and Environment Cluster</li> <li>• <i>KRA2: Improved environmental outcomes</i> includes key priorities for air quality – <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Strengthening environmental regulation, including higher penalties</li> <li>○ National focus on air particle pollution, including review of standards</li> <li>○ Reducing on-road diesel emissions, including from shipping</li> <li>○ Dust Stop Pollution Reduction Program, focusing on mines</li> <li>○ Reducing particle emission from coal handling and woodsmoke, and</li> <li>○ Expanding air quality monitoring networks, for example, in NSW north-western coal fields.</li> </ul> </li> </ul> <p>In response to discussion, Mr Davey offered to provide a more detailed briefing to the NCCCE to explain the NSW Government Planning and Environment Cluster.</p> <p><b>Action 1: EPA to provide a briefing at the next meeting of NCCCE, explaining the structure of the NSW Planning and Environment Cluster and the responsibilities of the EPA and the Office of Environment and heritage (OEH)</b></p> <p>The Chair commended the EPA, noted the plan and thanked Mr Davey.</p>

Agenda Item	Meeting Details
<p><b>Item 7</b></p>	<p><b>Review of NCCCE Achievements and Priority Actions 2014/15</b></p> <p>The EPA tabled a draft document which summarised the background and achievements of NCCCE. In discussion, the Committee agreed to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• provide feedback on the draft, with a view to providing the document to the third hearing of the Parliamentary Upper House Inquiry into the EPA, in response to a submission which criticised the NCCCE, and</li> <li>• publish the summary on the NCCCE webpage and to inform the media</li> </ul> <p><b>Action 2. EPA to email to NCCCE members the draft summary of NCCCE's achievements, for comment by 19 November 2014.</b></p> <p><b>Action 3: Chair to submit the final version of the summary of NCCCE's achievements and a cover letter to the Parliamentary Upper House Inquiry into the EPA, in response to a submission which criticised the NCCCE.</b></p> <p><b>Action 4. EPA to publish the summary of NCCCE's achievements on the NCCCE webpage and release a media statement, to coincide with the NCCCE meeting on 10 December 2014. EPA, on behalf of NCCCE, to invite the local media to attend a pre-meeting gathering of NCCCE at 5:30 pm on 10 December 2014.</b></p>
<p><b>Item 8</b></p>	<p><b>Update on EPA Lower Hunter Air Quality Projects</b></p> <p><b>Newcastle Local Air Quality Monitoring Network</b></p> <p>Orica transferred the Stockton AQMS to the OEH-operated Network in October. OEH installed new equipment view. Data may be downloaded for 1 November 2014 onward.</p> <p><b>Lower Hunter Community Research Project (Refer to Item 5 above).</b></p> <p><b>Lower Hunter and Lake Macquarie-Wyong Monthly Air Quality Reports</b></p> <p>EPA reviewed the Lower Hunter Air Quality Monthly Reports for June to August 2014 and publication on NCCCE webpages is imminent. Summary results are as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• In June 2014, air quality levels showed no exceedences of relevant criteria.</li> <li>• In July 2014, air quality levels showed no exceedences, other than Mayfield HVAS which showed a 24-hour average PM<sub>10</sub> concentration of 98 µg/m<sup>3</sup>, Industry advised that this site was adjacent construction works.</li> <li>• In August 2014, air quality levels showed no exceedences, other than an uncertain result, when the Beresfield monitor recorded a 24-hour average PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentration of 26.2 µg/m<sup>3</sup>, compared to the national advisory standard of 25 µg/m<sup>3</sup>. The co-located Tapered Element Oscillating Microbalance (TEOM) monitor recorded a 24-hour average PM<sub>10</sub> level of 24.8 µg/m<sup>3</sup>, which was lower than the PM<sub>2.5</sub> level recorded by the Beta Attenuated Monitor (BAM). By definition, PM<sub>2.5</sub> is a subset of PM<sub>10</sub>, and so it is not possible for there to be more PM<sub>2.5</sub> than PM<sub>10</sub> in the air at any place at the same time. However, it is not unusual to measure higher levels of PM<sub>2.5</sub> than PM<sub>10</sub> on occasions, due to differences between the measurement technologies of the BAM and TEOM and other technical issues. The report noted that environmental factors, such as high relative humidity, may have caused the different results from the two measurement instruments.</li> </ul>

Agenda Item	Meeting Details
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• These reports complete the EPA-funded project which provided air quality monthly reports for the Lower Hunter, pending the commissioning of the Newcastle Local Air Quality Monitoring Network (NLAQMN).</li> <li>• OEH will present a commissioning report on the NLAQMN, at the next NCCCE meeting. The report will describe the results of continuous monitoring at Carrington, Mayfield and Stockton, as well as Newcastle, Wallsend, Beresfield. NCCCE members will have an opportunity to provide feedback on the format of the reports. In 2015, OEH will provide quarterly reports to the NCCCE, including a seasonal analysis of weather conditions.</li> <li>• The EPA is working with Lake Macquarie City Council and Todoroski Air Sciences to plan a workshop in December 2014, to review the first draft Lake Macquarie – Wyong Air Quality Monthly Report.</li> </ul> <p><b>Lower Hunter Particle Characterisation Study</b></p> <p>The Project Reference Group meeting was held on 23/10/14 via teleconference. Keith Craig represented NCCCE. Key points included:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The twelve-month sampling, which commenced in March 2014, is on track.</li> <li>• OEH published the study's <i>Second Progress Report (Winter)</i> on 10/11/14 at <a href="http://www.environment.nsw.gov.au/aqms/lowhunterparticle.htm">http://www.environment.nsw.gov.au/aqms/lowhunterparticle.htm</a>. The report documents the quality assurance procedures for samples collected during the second quarter, from June to August 2014 and includes an analysis of winds and photographs of the sampling sites.</li> <li>• Next meeting will be held on 27/12/14. The final report is due in early 2016.</li> </ul> <p><b>Lower Hunter Dust Deposition Study</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• AECOM installed dust gauges at 12 sites and the monthly sampling has commenced.</li> <li>• No swab sampling has commenced as yet.</li> <li>• AECOM is updating the methodology paper.</li> <li>• Next Meeting will be held 20/11/14. The final report is due in late 2015.</li> </ul>
Item 9	<p><b>General Business</b></p> <p>Mr Craig requested an update in response to community concerns regarding Crawford's premises at Sandgate, which stores ammonium nitrate.</p> <p>Mr Gilligan advised that the EPA responded to two recent issues at Crawford's:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Community members received a flyer about security aspects and explosive risks at the site, circulated from an anonymous source, after journalists gained unauthorised accesses to the site. The EPA referred the issue to WorkCover. Site security was increased after the incident.</li> <li>• The EPA responded to concerns regarding Crawford's fumigation of timber logs using methyl bromide, a substance restricted by the Montreal Protocol except in certain circumstances. The EPA served Crawford's with a notice to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Undertake monitoring of methyl bromide downwind of operations and to stop fumigating when thresholds are exceeded,</li> <li>○ Provide an air quality assessment within two months, including risk management procedures</li> </ul> </li> </ul>

Agenda Item	Meeting Details
	<p>Mr Craig requested that the EPA provide an update at the next meeting regarding the progress of the Orica environmental service orders required by the Land and Environment as part penalty for the pollution incident in August 2011.</p> <p><b>Action 5: EPA to provide an update on the progress of the Orica environmental service orders required by the Land and Environment as part penalty for the pollution incident in August 2011.</b></p> <p>The Chair thanked the Committee and the EPA. All wished Ms Rogers well in future.</p>
<b>Item 9</b>	<p><b>Next Meeting</b></p> <p><b>Date:</b> Wednesday 10 December 2014.</p> <p><b>Location:</b> EPA Conference Room, Ground Floor, 117 Bull Street, Newcastle West</p> <p><b>Time:</b> 5:30 pm to 7:30 pm</p>
<b>Meeting ended at 7:20 pm</b>	

#### ACTION ITEM LOG

NCCCE MEETING NO. 31, 8 October 2014 - ACTIONS	DUE	RESP
<b>Action 1:</b> EPA to provide a briefing at the next meeting of NCCCE, explaining the structure of the NSW Planning and Environment Cluster and the responsibilities of the EPA and the Office of Environment and Heritage (OEH)	10/12/14	EPA
<b>Action 2:</b> EPA to email to NCCCE members an MS Word version of the draft summary of NCCCE's achievements, for comment by 19 November 2014.	ASAP	EPA
<b>Action 3:</b> Chair to submit the final version of the summary of NCCCE's achievements and a cover letter to the Parliamentary Upper House Inquiry into the EPA, in response to a submission which criticised the NCCCE.	ASAP	Chair
<b>Action 4:</b> EPA to publish the summary of NCCCE's achievements on the NCCCE webpage and release a media statement, to coincide with the NCCCE meeting on 10 December 2014. EPA, on behalf of NCCCE, to invite the local media to attend a pre-meeting gathering of NCCCE at 5:30 pm on 10 December 2014.	ASAP	Chair
<b>Action 5:</b> EPA to provide an update on the progress of the Orica environmental service orders required by the Land and Environment as part penalty for the pollution incident in August 2011.	10/12/14	EPA