

**MEETING No. 20**  
**Newcastle Community Consultative Committee on the Environment**  
**(NCCCE)**

**MEETING MINUTES**

**Date:** 14 August 2013 **Time:** 5:30 pm

**File:** FIL11/10927

**Location:** EPA Conference Room, Ground Floor,  
 117 Bull Street, Newcastle West

**In attendance:** John Tate (Chair), Keith Craig (Community), Adam Gilligan (Newcastle City Council), Nick Godfrey-Smith (Industry), Kate Johnson (Community); Paul McBain (Minister’s Nominee), Paul Thomas (Industry), Zoe Rogers (Environment) Gary Davey (EPA Director North), Leanne Graham (EPA Project Officer, Hunter Region)

**Apologies** Hon Robyn Parker MP, Minister for the Environment, Graham Woods (Industry), Mitchell Bennett (EPA A/Manager Hunter Region), Ann-Louise Crotty (EPA Manager Air Policy), Sylvia Bell (EPA Director Stakeholder Engagement and Governance)

**Meeting Record**

Agenda Item	Meeting Details
Item 1	<b>Welcome and Introductions</b> The Chair welcomed Committee Members and EPA staff.
Item 2	<b>Apologies</b> As above.
Item 3	<p><b>Minutes from Previous Meeting</b> NCCCE members requested amendments to the draft minutes.</p> <p><b>Item 4. Actions Arising from Previous Meetings</b> The following text:  <u>Meeting No.18 (12Jun13) Action 2: Deferred to Meeting No.20 (14Aug13). NCCCE members to consider priorities for action in context of EPA air quality projects 2013/14.</u>            Amended to:  <u>Meeting No.18 (12Jun13) Action 2: Deferred to Meeting No.20 (14Aug13). NCCCE to discuss NCCCE achievements and priorities for action.</u></p> <p><b>Item 5. Update on Particle Monitoring Study by Australian Rail Track Corporation</b>            Additional text: <i>The community representatives specifically suggested involvement of the community in the initial stages through to the data analysis, if further studies are required.</i></p>

Agenda Item	Meeting Details
<p><b>Item 3 (Cont)</b></p>	<p><b>Minutes from Previous Meeting (Cont).</b>  <b>Item 10. General Business</b>            The following text:  <i>ACTION 5: The NCCCE accepts its role as a conduit to the community to fulfil the opportunities for wider community engagement in the development and implementation of the air quality projects in the Hunter Region.</i>            Amended to:  <i>NCCCE acknowledged the need for the EPA to engage with the wider community in other ways, not only via the NCCCE.</i>  <i>ACTION 5: NCCCE to further discuss the committee's role in improving communication between industry and the community.</i>  <b>Action Item Log</b>            NCCCE requested that the Action Item Log in the meeting minutes includes any outstanding actions of previous meetings, as provided in meeting agendas.            Minutes of Meeting No.19 (10 July 2013), incorporating the above amendments, were adopted as a true and accurate record.</p>
<p><b>Item 4</b></p>	<p><b>Actions Arising from Previous Meetings</b>  <u>Meeting No.18 (12Jun13) Action 1:</u> In progress. Initial discussion at Meeting No.19 (10 Jul13), Item 10 General Business. Further discussion deferred to Meeting No.21 (16 Sep13). NCCCE to discuss how to promote dialogue between industry and the community to rebuild the community's confidence in the environmental performance of industry. This item is a key responsibility of NCCCE as stated in the NCCCE Terms of Reference, Functions of the Committee.  <u>Meeting No.18 (12Jun13) Action 2:</u> Deferred to Meeting No.21 (16Sep13). NCCCE to discuss NCCCE achievements and priorities for action.  <u>Meeting No.19 (10Jul13) Action 1:</u> In progress. EPA to brief NCCCE about the Newcastle Particle Characterisation in Item 6 (below).  <u>Meeting No.19 (10Jul13) Action 2:</u> In progress. EPA to brief NCCCE about the Lower Hunter Community Information, Communication and Research Project, Item 7 (below).  <u>Meeting No.19 (10Jul13) Action 3:</u> In progress. EPA to report to NCCCE on priority outcomes for action from the workshop on air science, policy and communication at Meeting No.21 (16 Sep13).  <u>Meeting No.19 (10 Jul13) Action 4:</u> In progress. NCCCE members to identify top six outcomes for action from the workshop for discussion, Item 8 (below).</p>
<p><b>Item 5</b></p>	<p><b>Key Messages from Minister for the Environment, Hon Robyn Parker MP</b>            On behalf of the Minister, Gary Davey thanked the NCCCE members and the Chair for their contributions and achievements since the NCCCE's inception in November 2011. Mr Davey noted the Minister had written to each Committee member and the Chair, advising the NCCCE will continue for at least two years and inviting members to continue their membership.</p>

Agenda Item	Meeting Details
<p><b>Item 5 (Cont)</b></p>	<p><b>Key Messages from Minister for the Environment, Hon Robyn Parker MP (Cont)</b></p> <p>Mr Davey delivered key messages from the Minister:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• NCCCE has provided a valuable forum, articulating the views of the broader community, not only to the Minister but also to the EPA.</li> <li>• NCCCE’s regular meetings and community forums have helped share knowledge and ensured that the community is better informed. The community’s response has demonstrated that air quality remains an issue of concern.</li> <li>• NCCCE has played an active role in the planning for the proposed Newcastle air quality monitoring network, by consulting with the wider community and inspecting and endorsing the preferred locations for monitoring sites.</li> <li>• The monthly reports on Lower Hunter air quality, initiated by the NCCCE and published on the EPA website assist the wider community to understand the monitoring results.</li> <li>• NCCCE has an important role to play in ensuring that other community and industry groups are engaged in the EPA’s Newcastle Particle Characterisation Study and the Lower Hunter Community Information, Communication and Research Project, to integrate air pollution education and information programs.</li> </ul> <p>NCCCE members acknowledged receipt of letters from the Minister. The EPA invited members to respond to the Minister’s invitation for re-appointment, via email to the EPA.</p> <p>The Chair noted the Minister’s message and thanked Mr Davey.</p>
<p><b>Item 6</b></p>	<p><b>Update on Newcastle Particle Characterisation Study</b></p> <p>Mr Davey provided an update on the study which will determine the main components of atmospheric particle matter. Mr Davey made the following points.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The EPA held a public forum at the Newcastle Regional Library, on 13 August 2013, to provide an overview of the study.</li> <li>• Technical experts, who worked on the Upper Hunter Particle Characterisation Study, Dr David Cohen of ANSTO (Australian Nuclear Science and Technology Organisation) and Dr Melita Keyword of CSIRO (Commonwealth Scientific and Industrial Research Organisation) explained complex matters in a simple way.</li> <li>• The Newcastle study will be more comprehensive than the Upper Hunter study. In response to community feedback at the forum, the EPA is investigating including PM<sub>10</sub> (particles less than 10 micrometers in diameter) as well as PM<sub>2.5</sub> (particles less than 2.5 micrometers in diameter) that are the greater health concern.</li> <li>• Options for the study include two monitoring sites for one year or one monitoring site for two years, to capture a wider range of seasonal variation.</li> <li>• The EPA invited the NCCCE to nominate a representative for the steering committee and recommended ongoing consultation via NCCCE, with public forums at key milestones in the study.</li> </ul> <p>NCCCE discussed the study options for particle sizes, the monitoring sites and sampling period, emphasising the importance of the study including PM<sub>10</sub>.</p> <p>NCCCE members agreed that the community wants to know more about the content of the black dust that settles on window sills and other surfaces and its health effects.</p>

Agenda Item	Meeting Details
<p><b>Item 6 (cont)</b></p>	<p><b>Update on Newcastle Particle Characterisation Study (Cont)</b></p> <p>The committee discussed ways to investigate total suspended particulates (TSP) that is the visible particles that settle on surfaces.</p> <p>The Chair noted the information and thanked Mr Davey. The Chair deferred to General Business further discussion regarding the NCCCE's nominee on the steering committee for the Newcastle particle characterisation study.</p> <p><b>ACTION 1: The EPA will update NCCCE on the Newcastle particle characterisation study progressively and at the next meeting.</b></p> <p>The EPA responded to a question from NCCCE environment representative, Ms Zoe Rogers, taken on notice by the EPA at the public forum on 13 August 2013.</p> <p>Ms Rogers enquired about the source of the assessment criterion, PM<sub>10</sub> annual average concentration of 30 ug/m<sup>3</sup> used in the EPA's assessment of the Port Waratah Coal Services' T4 proposal.</p> <p>Criterion for air quality impact assessments is found in:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- <i>Approved Methods for the Modelling and Assessment of Air Pollutants in New South Wales</i> (DEC, 2005), and</li> <li>- <i>Action for Air: The NSW Government's 25-Year Air Quality Management Plan</i>, (EPA 1998).</li> </ul> <p>The Chair noted the information and thanked the EPA.</p>
<p><b>Item 7</b></p>	<p><b>Update on Lower Hunter Community Information, Communication and Research</b></p> <p>Mr Davey presented an outline of the <i>Lower Hunter Community Based Participatory Research Project</i>. Mr Davey made the following points:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Sylvia Bell presented an overview of the project at the EPA public forum on 13 August 2013.</li> <li>• The study will involve collaboration among community representatives, with input from industry, business, government and researchers.</li> <li>• The project involves the community in developing the research questions, interpreting results, disseminating results and recommending solutions.</li> <li>• The project aims to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Increase community understanding about local air quality issues</li> <li>○ Contribute to initiatives to address air issues</li> <li>○ Foster trust and working relationships between community and government</li> <li>○ Empower local communities to engage in discussions on air quality.</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Phase 1 will develop the scope of the project, identify key participants and draft the research questions.</li> <li>• Phase 2 will involve preparation of a research proposal, a tender selection process, implementing the research, interpreting and communicating the results.</li> </ul> <p>The NCCCE discussed potential issues for investigation and options for community engagement. The Chair noted the information and thanked Mr Davey.</p> <p><b>ACTION 2: The EPA will update NCCCE on the community based participatory research project progressively and at the next meeting.</b></p>

Agenda Item	Meeting Details
<p><b>Item 8</b></p>	<p><b>Outcomes of Workshop on Air, Science, Policy and Communication, held on 12 April 2013</b></p> <p>NCCCE members identified the top six outcomes for action from the workshop:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>i. Improve education and participation to better understand issues. This outcome came in response to the question, “What can EPA and NCCCE do to build trust with the community regarding local air quality issues?”</li> </ol> <p>The next four outcomes came in response to the question, “How can the EPA better communicate air science and policy to the wider community?”</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>ii. A regular local radio weekly timeslot.</li> <li>iii. Provide performance of key industries in the Lower Hunter and how they meet licence conditions (monthly updates).</li> <li>iv. Develop a smart phone ‘Air App’ to include air pollution hot spot reporting.</li> <li>v. Provide monthly average concentration of PM<sub>2.5</sub> and year to date average PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentration, to illustrate how values are tracking towards the annual average PM<sub>2.5</sub> criterion of 8 micrograms per cubic metre.</li> </ol> <p>The next outcome came in response to an open question, inviting additional comments:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>vi. Publicising the cost of pollution to society, both in terms of damages to the environment and the health burden in NSW.</li> </ol> <p><b>ACTION 3: The EPA to consider the NCCCE’s top six outcomes from the workshop held 12 April and to respond at the next meeting.</b></p> <p>Mr Adam Gilligan, Newcastle City Council’s representative, demonstrated two smart phone Apps that illustrate the potential of a smart phone to deliver the types of information recommended. The first App displayed air quality information for China. The second App showed the location of restaurants in New York city and described how the restaurant performed at its last health inspection. Mr Gilligan suggested that the EPA could do a similar app for its licensed premises.</p>
<p><b>Item 9</b></p>	<p><b>EPA Coal Seam Gas Policy and Procedures</b></p> <p>Mr Davey presented an outline of the coal seam gas (CSG) policy and procedures for NSW. Mr Davey made the following points:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The CSG industry in NSW is a relatively new, with the majority of operations in the exploration stage.</li> <li>• The Office of Coal Seam Gas within Department of Trade and Investment, Regional Infrastructure and Services grants a Petroleum Exploration Lease (PEL) or a Petroleum Assessment lease (PAL) in accordance with the Petroleum (Onshore) Act 1991.</li> <li>• These leases enable a range of CSG activities to be undertaken within a defined area. A Review of Environmental Factors and specialist information is required for each stage of any CSG project.</li> <li>• CSG exploration is mostly in areas adjacent to coal mining (Hunter, Liverpool Plains, Gunnedah Basin) and the North Coast, where there are no coal mines.</li> <li>• At present, the AGL Camden Project is the only project approved for petroleum production and in operation, with approximately 130 wells.</li> </ul>

Agenda Item	Meeting Details
<p><b>Item 9 (Cont)</b></p>	<p><b>EPA Coal Seam Gas Policy and Procedures (Cont)</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Two operations have received approval for petroleum production but are not yet in operation: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Metgasco Richmond Valley coal seam gas and gas fired power station, with approval for 45 wells and</li> <li>○ AGL Gloucester Project, with approval for 110 wells and concept approval for up to 300 wells</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Three departments regulate fracking: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ NSW Office of Coal Seam Gas administers the <i>NSW Code of Practice for Coal Seam Gas – Fracture Stimulation Activities</i>;</li> <li>○ NSW Office of Water administers the <i>Aquifer Interference Policy</i></li> <li>○ NSW EPA administers the <i>Protection of Environment Operations Act</i> which protects groundwater from pollution.</li> </ul> </li> <li>• In February 2013, NSW Government strengthened the CSG regulatory framework and made the EPA lead regulator of environmental and health impacts, to protect agricultural land, water resources and residential communities.</li> <li>• All activities now require an Environment Protection Licence.</li> <li>• EPA resources include \$1.9 million in 2013/14 for 10 new staff; training, field laboratory equipment and \$0.5 million for a fugitive emissions program to develop benchmarks for future regulation.</li> <li>• The EPA will develop fact sheets, frequently asked questions and operational guidance.</li> <li>• Further information is available at EPA CSG page:  <a href="http://www.epa.nsw.gov.au/licensing/coalseamgas.htm">http://www.epa.nsw.gov.au/licensing/coalseamgas.htm</a>  and  <a href="http://www.epa.nsw.gov.au/licensing/licencePOEO.htm">http://www.epa.nsw.gov.au/licensing/licencePOEO.htm</a> </li> </ul> <p>The Chair noted the information and thanked Mr Davey.</p>
<p><b>Item 10</b></p>	<p><b>Progress Report – Newcastle Air Quality Monitoring Network</b></p> <p>The EPA intends to accept the Hunter Business Chamber's (HBC) offer to facilitate further discussions between industries and the EPA to reach consensus on the funding models for the air quality monitoring network in the Newcastle area.</p> <p>Mr Davey identified that the EPA was of the view the network would incorporate three stations located at Stockton, Carrington and Mayfield West. The next meeting is planned for 5 September 2013.</p> <p>The Chair noted the information and thanked Mr Davey.</p>

Agenda Item	Meeting Details
<p><b>Item 11</b></p>	<p><b>General Business</b></p> <p>Mr Keith Craig accepted nomination as NCCCE community representative on the steering committee for the particle characterisation study.</p> <p>NCCCE environment and community representatives suggested that the project steering team for particle characterisation study include an additional community member with links to the wider community. The Committee noted that Keith Craig was the NCCCE nominee and is a highly competent representative. Nonetheless, the Committee considered that Mr Craig's workload and other commitments meant that a second representative would be useful.</p> <p>The EPA noted that the NCCCE was the primary conduit for community consultation and that NCCCE member Keith Craig had been nominated as that representative. Accordingly, the EPA did not support expanding the steering committee.</p> <p>NCCCE agreed that the next meeting include agenda items on:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• NCCCE views and suggestions on the NCCCE's achievements and priorities for action.</li> <li>• Discussion of ways that NCCCE can promote dialogue between industry and the community to rebuild the community's confidence in the environmental performance of industry.</li> </ul>
<p><b>Item 12</b></p>	<p><b>Next Meeting</b></p> <p><b>Date:</b> Monday, 16 September 2013</p> <p><b>Location:</b> EPA Conference Room, Ground Floor, 117 Bull Street, Newcastle West</p> <p><b>Time:</b> 5:30 pm to 7:30 pm</p>
<p><b>Meeting ended at 7:50 pm</b></p>	

## ACTION ITEM LOG

ACTION / RECOMMENDATION		STATUS	RESP
<b>MEETING NO. 18, 12 June 2013</b>			
<b>ACTIONS</b>			
1	NCCCE members to bring to the next NCCCE meeting current examples of community engagement by local industries.	16 Sep 13	NCCCE
2	NCCCE members to bring to the next NCCCE meeting views and suggestions on the NCCCE's achievements and priorities for action.	16 Sep 13	NCCCE
<b>MEETING NO. 19, 10 July 2013</b>			
<b>ACTIONS</b>			
1	<del>EPA to brief NCCCE about the Newcastle Particle Characterisation Study at the next meeting.</del>	Completed 14 Aug 13	EPA Director North
2	<del>EPA to brief NCCCE about the Lower Hunter Community Information, Communication and Research Project at the next meeting.</del>	Completed 14 Aug 13	EPA Director North
3	<del>EPA to report to NCCCE on priority outcomes for action from the workshop on air science, policy and communication, at the next meeting</del>	Completed 14 Aug 13	EPA Stakeholder Engagement
4	<del>NCCCE members to identify top six outcomes for action from the workshop for discussion, at the next meeting</del>	Completed 14 Aug 13	NCCCE, EPA Project Officer
5	NCCCE to further discuss the committee's role in improving communication between industry and the community.	16 Sep 13	NCCCE
<b>MEETING NO. 20, 14 August 2013</b>			
<b>ACTIONS</b>			
1	The EPA to update NCCCE on the Newcastle particle characterisation study progressively and at the next meeting.	16 Sep 13	EPA
2	The EPA to update NCCCE on the community based participatory research project progressively and at the next meeting	16 Sep 13	EPA
3	The EPA to consider the NCCCE's top six outcomes from the workshop held 12 April and respond at the next meeting.	16 Sep 13	EPA