

MEETING No. 18
Newcastle Community Consultative Committee on the Environment
(NCCCE)

MEETING MINUTES

Date: 12 June 2013 **Time:** 5:30 pm

File: FIL11/10927

Location: EPA Conference Room, Ground Floor,
 117 Bull Street, Newcastle West

In attendance: John Tate (Chair), Keith Craig (Community), Adam Gilligan (Newcastle City Council), Nick Godfrey-Smith (Industry), Kate Johnson (Community); Paul McBain (Minister's Nominee), Paul Thomas (Industry), Graham Woods (Industry), Zoe Rogers (Environment)
 Leanne Graham (EPA Project Officer, Hunter Region)

Apologies Mitchell Bennett (EPA A/Manager Hunter Region), Mark Hartwell (EPA Head, Regional Operations, Hunter Region), Matt Riley (Office of Environment and Heritage (OEH) Director Atmospheric and Climate Science)

Meeting Record

Agenda Item	Meeting Details
Item 1	Welcome from the Chair The Chair welcomed Committee Members and the EPA staff member.
Item 2	Apologies As above.
Item 3	Minutes from Previous Meeting Minutes of Meeting No.17 (8 May 2013) were adopted as a true and accurate record, with minor typographical amendments.
Item 4	Actions Arising from Previous Meetings <u>Meeting No.15 (13Feb13) Recommendation 3:</u> In progress. OEH to present information on air quality modelling, at NCCCE Meeting No.19, on 10 July 2013. <u>Meeting No.15 (13Feb13) Action 1:</u> In progress. OEH to respond to the <i>Stockton Air Quality Monitoring Station Report No.1</i> , prepared by NCCCE community representatives, at NCCCE Meeting No.19, on 10 July 2013. <u>Meeting No.16 (13Mar13) Action 1:</u> In progress. EPA to provide an outline of new policies and regulations on coal seam gas activities in NSW, at NCCCE Meeting No.19, on 10 July 2013. <u>Meeting No.17 (8May13) Action 1:</u> Completed 20 May 2013. NCCCE feedback incorporated into <i>Lower Hunter Air Quality Review of Ambient Air Quality Data March 2013</i> .

Agenda Item	Meeting Details
	<p>The Chair deferred Items 5.1, 5.2, 5.3 and 6.1 to Meeting No.19 (10Jul13), given the apologies (Item 2 above) from presenters who were unable to attend the meeting at short notice.</p>
<p>Item 5</p>	<p>Environmental Monitoring and Regulation</p> <p>5.1 Progress Report – Newcastle Air Quality Monitoring Network Deferred to Meeting No.19 (10Jul13).</p> <p>5.2 OEH report on Stockton Air Quality Monitoring Results Deferred to Meeting No.19 (10Jul13).</p> <p>5.3 OEH report on Airshed Modelling – Purpose and Methods Deferred to Meeting No.19 (10Jul13).</p> <p>5.4 Lower Hunter Monthly Air Quality Monitoring Report The EPA confirmed the approval of <i>Lower Hunter Air Quality Review of Ambient Air Quality Data, March 2013</i>, the first monthly report, for publication on the NCCCE website and incorporating the Committee’s feedback. The NCCCE reviewed the unpublished report of the <i>Lower Hunter Air Quality Review of Ambient Air Quality Data, April 2013</i>.</p> <p>RECOMMENDATION 1: That the EPA publishes the <i>Lower Hunter Air Quality Review of Ambient Air Quality Data, March 2013</i> on the NCCCE web page as soon as possible.</p> <p>RECOMMENDATION 2: That the report <i>Lower Hunter Air Quality Review of Ambient Air Quality Data, April 2013</i>, provides further discussion on the incidents of elevated levels of particulate matter.</p> <p>RECOMMENDATION 3: That the forthcoming reports of the <i>Lower Hunter Air Quality Review of Ambient Air Quality Data</i>, briefly discuss fluctuations in ammonia levels in relation to changes in wind speed and wind direction.</p>
<p>Item 6</p>	<p>Environmental Management Issues, including Health Impacts</p> <p>6.1 Workshop Outcomes: Air Science, Policy and Communication, 12 April 2013 Deferred to Meeting No.19 (10Jul13).</p>
<p>Item 7</p>	<p>General Business</p> <p>Particulate Emissions from Coal Trains Zoe Rogers, NCCCE Environment Representative, reported community concern about the report <i>Pollution Reduction Program 4.2 Particulate Emissions from Coal Trains</i>, prepared for the Australian Rail Track Corporation (ARTC), by Katestone Environmental. Ms Rogers tabled three related documents prepared for the Hunter Community Environment Centre (HCEC):</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <i>Comparison of the two versions of ARTC’s ‘Pollution Reduction Program 4.2 Particulate Emissions from Coal Trains’ report.</i> This document compared the findings in the Executive Summary of the final report, released by ARTC on 30 May 2013, and those in the Executive Summary of an earlier draft, dated 24 May 2013. Ms Rogers reported that local community members have requested a copy of the complete data set from Katestone Environmental. <i>Briefing Notes from University of Newcastle Public Health Academics meeting (7/6/13) to review ATRC PRP Study May 2013</i>, compiled by A/Prof Nick

Agenda Item	Meeting Details
	<p>Higginbotham. This document reviewed and questioned the methods, measures and conclusions of the published version of the report.</p> <p>3. <i>Comments on Pollution Reduction Program 4.2 Particulate Emissions from Coal Trains, Katestone Environmental</i>, prepared by A/Prof Adrian Barnett, Queensland University of Technology. This document questioned the method of determining statistical significance and suggested an alternative approach.</p> <p>With reference to the first tabled document, an Industry Representative interpreted the changes as clarifying the conclusions, rather than reversing the conclusions.</p> <p>The Committee agreed that without knowledge of the details, conclusions could not be drawn by the Committee with any certainty.</p> <p>A Community Representative, reiterating from a previous meeting, recommended that the EPA opens the discussion on the design of methodologies for Pollution Reduction Programs (PRPs), to include input from independent technical and non-technical experts from industry, community and academia. The community representative noted Dr Craig Dalton's recommendation in the Newcastle Herald (6 June 2013), for a collaborative approach, where all the stakeholders sit down and define the research questions, the study methods and the appropriate analyses before any data are collected.</p> <p>The EPA advised that appropriate EPA officer would report back to the next NCCCE meeting.</p> <p>RECOMMENDATION 4: That the EPA notes the NCCCE Community and Environment Representatives' view that the report on the second rail corridor dust study by the Australian Rail Track Corporation is unlikely to build community trust.</p> <p>RECOMMENDATION 5: That the EPA notes and reports back to the next NCCCE meeting regarding the documents tabled by the NCCCE Environment Representative in response to the second rail corridor dust study by the Australian Rail Track Corporation.</p> <p>Links between NCCCE and community groups</p> <p>Paul McBain, Minister's Nominee, raised the issue of NCCCE's responsibility for improving links between community groups and industry. The Committee discussed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • How to find out about views and issues currently being discussed in community groups and in the wider community regarding industry? • How to find out about current community engagement activities of industries, such as Orica and Port Waratah Coal Services? • NCCCE's role in improving interactions between communities and industries. <p>ACTION 1: NCCCE members to bring to the next NCCCE meeting current examples of community engagement by local industries.</p> <p>ACTION 2: NCCCE members to bring to the next NCCCE meeting suggestions and views on the Committee's achievements and priorities for action.</p> <p>RECOMMENDATION 6: That the EPA, on behalf of NCCCE, seeks the Minister's views on the achievements of the NCCCE and on the future role and function of the NCCCE. The EPA is to report back to the NCCCE on 8 August 2013 (refer to Meeting Minutes No.15, 13 February 2013).</p>

Agenda Item	Meeting Details
Item 8	<p>Next Meetings</p> <p>Date: Wednesday 10 July 2013, 14 August 2013</p> <p>Location: EPA Conference Room, Ground Floor, 117 Bull Street, Newcastle West</p> <p>Time: 5:30 pm to 7:30 pm</p>
Meeting ended at 7:30 pm	

ACTION ITEM LOG

MEETING NO. 18, 12 June 2013	ACTION ITEM DESCRIPTION/ RECOMMENDATION	DUE DATE	RESP
RECOMMENDATIONS			
1:	That the EPA publish the <i>Lower Hunter Air Quality Review of Ambient Air Quality Data, March 2013</i> on the NCCCE webpage as soon as possible.	ASAP	EPA
2	That the report <i>Lower Hunter Air Quality Review of Ambient Air Quality Data, April 2013</i> , provides further discussion on the incidents of elevated levels of particulate matter.	ASAP	EPA
3	That the forthcoming reports of the Lower Hunter Air Quality Review of Ambient Air Quality Data, briefly discuss fluctuations in ammonia levels in relation to changes in wind speed and wind direction.	10Jul13	EPA
4	That the EPA notes the NCCCE Community and Environment Representatives' view that the report on the second rail corridor dust study by the Australian Rail Track Corporation is unlikely to build community trust.	10Jul13	EPA
5	That the EPA notes and reports back to the next NCCCE meeting regarding the documents tabled by the NCCCE environment representative in response to the second rail corridor dust study by the Australian Rail Track Corporation.	10Jul13	EPA
6	That the EPA, on behalf of NCCCE, seeks the Minister's views on the achievements of the NCCCE and on the future role and function of the NCCCE. The EPA is to report back to the NCCCE on 8 August 2013 (refer to Minutes of Meeting No.15, 13 February 2013).	14Aug13	EPA
ACTIONS			
1:	NCCCE members to bring to the next NCCCE meeting current examples of community engagement by local industries.	10Jul13	NCCCE
2	NCCCE members to bring to the next NCCCE meeting views and suggestions on the NCCCE's achievements and priorities for action.	10Jul13	NCCCE