

MEETING No. 14

Newcastle Community Consultative Committee on the Environment (NCCCE)

MEETING MINUTES

Date: 12 December 2012 **Time:** 5:30 pm

File: FIL11/10927

Location: EPA Conference Room, Ground Floor, 117 Bull Street, Newcastle West

In attendance: John Tate (Chair), Keith Craig (Community), Adam Gilligan (Newcastle City Council), Nick Godfrey-Smith (Industry), Paul McBain (Minister's Nominee), Paul Thomas (Industry), Graham Woods (Industry).
Environment Protection Authority (EPA), Grahame Clarke (Regional Manager), Leanne Graham (Project Officer).

Apologies Kate Johnson (Community), Zoe Rogers (Environment).
Adam Gilligan (Newcastle City Council, post Item 8)

Meeting Record

Agenda Item	Meeting Details
Item 1	<p>Welcome from the Chair</p> <p>The Chair welcomed Committee Members and EPA staff.</p> <p>The Chair conveyed a message from Gary Davey (EPA Director North) that the Minister sends seasons greetings and thanked the NCCCE for its contribution during 2012. The Minister apologised for her inability to attend the meeting.</p>
Item 2	<p>Apologies</p> <p>As above.</p>
<p>The Chair deferred Item 3 to Item 7, for discussion following Item 8</p>	
Item 8	<p>2013 Planning</p> <p>On 3 December 2012, NCCCE Chair met Barry Buffier (EPA Chair) to assess the outcomes of the community forums on air quality, facilitated by the NCCCE and EPA in 2012.</p> <p>As a result of the meeting, the EPA proposed a series of workshops in 2013:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Air quality science - collection of air quality monitoring data and analysis of long term trends by OEH and EPA to drive policy that implements action to improve air quality. Case Study: Ozone exceedences in the Sydney and Illawarra regions 2. A scientific approach to air quality management - considerations in air policy development: analysis of long term ambient air quality and emissions inventory trends; health impacts and costs; cost-benefit analysis of emissions reduction

Agenda Item	Meeting Details
	<p>options; whole of government considerations in the context of budget constraints; allocating responsibility for actions across stakeholders; review of implementation.</p> <p>3. Communicating with the wider community - how EPA/OEH can report ambient air quality data in a more meaningful way and to build understanding and confidence in the EPA/OEH's scientific approach to air quality management.</p> <p>NCCCE endorsed the proposal in-principle and discussed advantages and disadvantages of scheduling options for the workshop sessions. The EPA will discuss the proposal in further detail with OEH and develop a project plan for 2013.</p>
Item 3	<p>Minutes from Previous Meeting</p> <p>Minutes of Meeting No.13 (5Novt 12) were adopted as a true and accurate record.</p>
Item 4	<p>Actions Arising from Previous Meeting</p> <p><u>Meeting No.13 (5 Nov 12) Recommendation 1:</u> The EPA noted the NCCCE's request to be kept informed on future developments in public communications strategies (Refer to Item 8, dot point (3) above).</p> <p><u>Meeting No.13 (5 Nov 12) Recommendation 2:</u> The EPA noted that the NCCCE's open invitation to the Minister to attend NCCCE meetings was forwarded to the Minister.</p> <p><u>Meeting No.13 (5 Nov 12) Recommendation 3:</u> The EPA noted the NCCCE's endorsement of sites for air quality monitoring stations at Mayfield, Carrington and Stockton. The OEH investigated a more suitable site at Fern Bay, off Vardon Road (Refer to Items 5 and 6, below).</p> <p><u>Meeting No.13 (5 Nov12) Recommendation 4:</u> The EPA forwarded to the Minister the NCCCE's recommendation to review protocols for online publication of presentations on the NCCCE website.</p> <p>Paul McBain (Minister's Nominee) discussed the issue with Minister, at a meeting on 6 December 2012. The Minister informed Mr McBain that a new EPA division, Stakeholder Engagement and Governance, was contributing to a review of the website protocols.</p> <p>The EPA noted that a new stand-alone EPA website will host the NCCCE webpage. Air quality monitoring data will be on a separate OEH website.</p> <p>The EPA explained that requests for online publications are considered individually. Issues and considerations include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • How well the presentation stands-alone. For example, many presentations contain only headings and may not include sufficient detail to be understood outside the context of the forum at which they are presented, • Copyright and intellectual property restrictions on images or content, • Whether the OEH endorses the opinions or conclusions of the author. <p><u>Meeting No.13 (5 Nov12) Action 1:</u> The Chair received the draft correspondence which requests briefings to NCCCE from relevant authorities. The Chair is yet to raise the matter with the Minister.</p>

Agenda Item	Meeting Details
<p>Item 4 (cont)</p>	<p>Actions Arising from Previous Meeting (cont)</p> <p><u>Meeting No.13 (5 Nov12) Action 1:</u> The Chair received the draft correspondence which requests briefings to NCCCE from relevant authorities. The Chair is yet to raise the matter with the Minister.</p> <p><u>Meeting No.13 (5 Nov 12) Action 2:</u> The EPA emailed to the NCCCE the web link to the Voluntary Management Proposal for the former Hamilton gasworks.</p> <p><u>Meeting No.12 (10 Oct 12) Recommendation 1:</u> NCCCE noted the EPA's delay in implementing the tender process for the provision of monthly air quality reports to NCCCE.</p> <p>RECOMMENDATION 1: NCCCE requests that the EPA accelerates procedures for the provision of monthly air quality reports to NCCCE.</p>
<p>Item 5</p>	<p>Progress Report – Newcastle Air Quality Monitoring Network</p> <p>The EPA emailed to NCCCE (21 November 2012) the updated briefing paper and site assessment for the location of an air quality monitoring station (AQMS) at Fern Bay. A new third option, located off Vardon Road offers greater exposure to industries on Kooragang Island, compared to the two initial Fern Bay sites. NCCCE noted the updated site assessment (Refer to Item 6 below).</p> <p>Paul McBain noted that the community group, Correct Planning and Consultation for Mayfield, asked that the EPA consider the location of an additional AQMS within the wetland reserve on Kooragang Island, to protect the health of components in the human food chain within the estuary. The EPA acknowledged the RAMSAR protected wetlands of the estuary and explained that the EPA could not support a site for an AQMS within the wetland reserve because a major criterion for an AQMS is proximity to human populations, rather than other populations of other species. Another major consideration is wind direction relative to the location of air pollution sources and populations. The meteorology study for the port does not identify north Kooragang Island as a necessary location for an AQMS. NCCCE noted the EPA's response and community representatives will report back to their relevant groups.</p> <p>The EPA provided an update on the industry consultation process for the network. The EPA's second meeting with industry will be held in the new year to discuss funding models. The EPA will report back to industry on the NCCCE's recommendations for the location of the monitoring sites.</p> <p>Keith Craig reported that the Orica AQMS has been updated to provide comparisons with NEPM [National Environment Protection (Ambient Air Quality) Measure] air quality goals and to include historical data. Mr Craig noted that since mid October, monitoring results for PM₁₀ showed nine days when the 24-hour average concentration exceeded 50 ug/m³. Mr Craig noted that the PM₁₀ NEPM goal allows for 5 exceedences of 50 ug/m³ per year and that the current NEPM review recommended removal of allowable exceedences.</p> <p>The EPA explained that the NEPM air quality standards are based on a health risk assessment, which involves consideration of a range of issues, compared with health benefits. As part of the current review of the NEPM, recommendations were made in 2011 to strengthen the NEPM to improve air quality and to minimise the health risk.</p>

Agenda Item	Meeting Details
Item 6	<p>Locations for Air Quality Monitoring Stations</p> <p>Community representatives confirmed that the third option at Fern Bay, off Vardon Road, was supported by those consulted within their respective communities.</p> <p>RECOMMENDATION 2: The NCCCE supports the location of four air quality monitoring stations, at the optimal sites in Mayfield, Carrington, Stockton and Fern Bay, as presented in the OEH site assessment reports and briefing paper</p>
Item 7	<p>Newcastle Community Forum on Health and Air Quality, 8 November 2012</p> <p>The NCCCE and EPA discussed the feedback from the Newcastle Community Forum on Health and Air Quality, held on 8 November 2012, at the John Gebhardt Centre in Waratah.</p> <p>ACTION 1: NCCCE to review notes and feedback from the Community Forum on Health and Air Quality for discussion at the next meeting.</p>
Item 9	<p>General Business</p> <p>Alternative Venue for Community Forums in 2013</p> <p>Paul McBain reported the Minister's support for the NCCCE to consider alternative venues for future community forums. Feedback from community members at the forum in November noted the inadequacies of the slide projection facility.</p> <p>Port Waratah Coal Services Health Report</p> <p>Paul McBain noted that Kate Johnson (NCCCE Community Representative) requests that NCCCE discuss the report in further detail in 2013.</p> <p>Carrington Coal Terminal Noise Issues</p> <p>Keith Craig reported positive feedback from the community, following significant improvements in noise management at the Carrington Coal Terminal.</p> <p>ARTC Study - Particulate Monitoring in Rail Corridor</p> <p>Paul McBain referred to his request to the EPA for community input on the methodology for the second stage of the ARTC particle monitoring campaign in the rail corridor. Mr McBain noted that the study had commenced without community input and that the monitoring included only one site, rather than two sites, as in the initial study. The community had requested an on-site meeting to observe the monitoring procedure.</p> <p>Grahame Clarke explained that only the Metford site offered a 'train counter' to provide accurate data on the timing and types of trains passing the monitor. Also, the study will analyse air quality when no trains pass. Mr Clarke noted that safety issues prohibit public access to the rail corridor. Raw data would be available on request.</p>
Item 10	<p>Next Meeting</p> <p>Date: Wednesday 13 February 2013</p> <p>Location: EPA Conference Room, Ground Floor, 117 Bull Street, Newcastle West</p> <p>Time: 5:30 pm to 7:30 pm</p>
<p>Meeting ended at 19:35</p>	

ACTION ITEM LOG

MEETING NO. 14, 12 DECEMBER 2012	ACTION ITEM DESCRIPTION/ RECOMMENDATION	DUE DATE	RESP
RECOMMENDATION 1	NCCCE requests that the EPA accelerates procedures for the provision of monthly air quality reports to NCCCE.	ASAP	EPA
RECOMMENDATION 2	The NCCCE supports the location of four air quality monitoring stations, at the optimal sites in Mayfield, Carrington, Stockton and Fern Bay, as presented in the OEH site assessment reports and briefing paper.	ASAP	EPA
ACTION 1	NCCCE to review notes and feedback from the Community Forum on Health and Air Quality for discussion at the next meeting.	13 Feb	